

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH
CAROLINA WESTERN DIVISION
No. 5:22-CV-00015-FL**

ROBERT TERRACINO and
BRADIE TERRACINO,

Plaintiffs,

v.

TRIMACO, INC.,

Defendant.

**PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO
TRIMACO'S RESPONSE REGARDING
MARKMAN HEARING (DKT. 65) AND
MOTION TO STRIKE**

COME NOW Plaintiffs Robert and Bradie Terracino (the “Terracinos” or “Plaintiffs”) and pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(f) and the Court’s rulings from the bench on February 1, 2024, hereby submit this Opposition and Motion to Strike Defendant Trimaco, Inc.’s (“Trimaco’s” or “Defendant’s”) Response Regarding Markman Hearing (Dkt. [65](#)) concerning the construction of certain claim terms of U.S. Patent No. 9,044,917 (the “’917 Patent”).

I. BACKGROUND

The Court heard oral argument on the proposed claim constructions for the patent at issue in this matter (the ‘917 Patent) on Thursday, February 1, 2024. Two of the claims at issue - Claim 1 and Claim 6 – were argued in Defendant’s pleadings (Dkts. [40](#) and [45](#)) and by Defendant at oral argument to be indefinite on the basis of the claimed testing procedure and results in the claims and described in the specification of the ‘917 Patent. The Transcript of that hearing is in the Court’s records at Dkt. [64](#).

In response to argument of counsel for Trimaco, the Court granted leave to Trimaco to file supplemental argument in regards to the testing procedures at issue before the Court. Dkt. [64](#) at 68:2-8. The Court further granted Plaintiffs leave to “have the last word.” *Id.* at 68:9-16.

Trimaco filed its Response styled “Supplemental Claim Construction Submission” on February 6, 2024. Dkt. [62](#). Plaintiffs filed their Response to Trimaco’s “Supplemental Claim Construction Submission” on February 12, 2024. Dkt. [63](#).¹ In direct contravention to the Court providing Plaintiffs with the “last word” on the matter, without discussing any additional pleadings with Plaintiffs, and without leave of Court, Trimaco filed a Response regarding Markman Hearing (Supplement to Claim Construction Hearing) on February 23, 2024. Dkt. [65](#).

Because Trimaco filed its February 23, 2024 Response in direct contravention to the Court’s rulings from the bench on February 1, 2024, without consultation with Plaintiffs, and without leave of Court, the Court should disregard Trimaco’s Response at Dkt. [65](#) and strike the same from the record.

II. CONCLUSION

For the reasons set forth herein, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court decline to consider Trimaco’s Response filed on February 23, 2024 and strike the same from the record.

February 27, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Duncan G. Byers

¹ The five days provided by the Court for Plaintiff’s “last word” on the matter expired on Sunday, February 11, 2024 and Plaintiff’s filing was therefore entered on Monday, February 12, 2024.

Duncan G. Byers
BYERS LAW
1769 Jamestown Road, Suite 120
Williamsburg, Virginia 23185
(757) 317-2779
Fax (757) 231-3797
dbyers@dbyerslaw.com
Va. Bar ID No. 48146
Special Appearance Counsel for Plaintiffs
Robert and Bradie Terracino

/s/William Ellis Boyle
William Ellis Boyle
N.C. State I.D. No.: 33826
email: docket@wardandsmith.com
email: weboyle@wardandsmith.com
Ward and Smith, P.A.
Post Office Box 33009
Wilmington, NC 27636-3009
Telephone: 919.277.9100
Facsimile: 919.277.9177
Local Civil Rule 83.1(d) Attorney for Plaintiffs

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on February 27, 2024 I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record.

/s/ Duncan G. Byers
Duncan G.
Byers
BYERS LAW
1769 Jamestown Road, Suite 120
Williamsburg, Virginia 23185
(757) 317-2779
Fax (757) 231-3797
dbyers@dbyerslaw.com

Va. Bar ID
No. 48146

*Special Appearance Counsel for
Plaintiffs
Robert and Bradie Terracino*

/s/William Ellis Boyle

William Ellis Boyle
N.C. State I.D. No.: 33826
email: docket@wardandsmith.com
email: eboyle@wardandsmith.com
Ward and Smith, P.A.
Post Office Box 33009
Wilmington, NC 27636-3009
Telephone: 919.277.9100
Facsimile: 919.277.9177
*Local Civil Rule 83.1(d) Attorney
for Plaintiffs*